THE MINISTRY OF PRESENCE AND OPERATIONAL STRESS

Joanne Benham Rennick, doctoral student, University of Waterloo/Wilfrid Laurier joint PhD program in Religious Studies

With additional psychological and mental health training chaplains could become an effective first line of care resource for soldiers dealing with operational stress during a tour of duty. Unlike other mental health care options available to soldiers, there is no stigma attached to talking to the chaplain. Because stigma associated with mental health problems is a serious detriment to the treatment of mental health issues in the Canadian Forces, chaplains with some psychological training could offer a “neutral” or non-stigmatised option for soldiers with mental health issues to get help. In addition to serving in theatre with soldiers, the Canadian Forces chaplains practice a “Ministry of Presence”\(^1\) that creates the opportunity to establish relationships and a level of trust between the padre and the soldiers that is not often present for outside health professionals who might try to assist soldiers dealing with operational stress. Additionally, chaplains can play an essential role in identifying opportunities for community development projects that let soldiers participate in work that alleviates human suffering and creates hope for suffering civilians. These factors combined suggest that the military chaplain is an underused resource in the initial treatment of post-traumatic stress disorder and other mental health problems that arise in the course of a soldier’s duties. In order to make chaplains an effective first-line of care for soldiers

\(^1\) The Department of National Defence defines the Ministry of Presence as, “being available to, and known by, the soldier, being available for a comforting chat, developing a relationship with the members of the unit, and participation in unit life...[This ministry] makes the chaplaincy an outward and visible sign of the church who cares and consoles.” Department of National Defence, Canada, “Chaplains: What They Do,” (41 Canadian Brigade Group. January 30, 2003. http://www.army.dnd.ca/41cbg_hq/61chaplain.htm), retrieved October 24, 2004, para 7. This topic is addressed more fully in the section The Ministry of Presence and Relationship.

©Centre for Military and Strategic Studies, Canadian Defence & Foreign Affairs Institute, 2005.
under stress, the military will have to offer them special training. Moreover, these new roles could lead to greater stress for the chaplains themselves. Consequently, chaplains will have to integrate techniques of self-care in order to remain effective.

Finally, if we propose that chaplains may be a resource for soldiers suffering under stress we must first gain a clearer understanding of the role religion plays in the lives of armed forces personnel.

**Stigma of Mental Health Problems**

Mental stress in the Canadian Forces is extremely high. In fact, “since 11 September 2001 ever larger elements of the Canadian Forces have been suffering from levels of stress and overwork that transcend ‘abusive,’” a situation that could become a “devastating crisis in the mental health of the Canadian Forces.” Even more disturbingly, there is a tendency within the CF to stigmatize and abuse those identified with mental health problems because other soldiers often see them as “malingeringers and fakers.” Consequently, a large number of suffering soldiers will not come forward for help and treatment.

Several aspects of military culture make it both highly competitive and highly exclusive. The Armed Forces seeks to recruit and retain mentally, physically and emotionally “tough” individuals. Military personnel may be identified as “weak,” or unfit for service, because they are not physically, psychologically or emotionally robust. This

---


3 Ibid., 21.

presents a serious problem for the Canadian Forces in that almost everyone, military or otherwise, experiences mental and emotional stresses at some point in their lives. In fact, in broader society over a one year period, as many as “one in four people will suffer from a mental illness.” However, in the civilian context, there are many informal opportunities to deal with that stress. For example, in a civilian situation, a person struggling from stress and personal anxiety arising from a marital problem might talk to a friend, attend a support group, seek marital counselling, take a leave from work or plan a vacation.

Because of the highly competitive and exclusive nature of military culture, the stigma associated with mental illness pressures soldiers to hide these problems so that one is not labelled “weak.” Additionally, the rigid nature of a soldier’s responsibilities could make it more difficult to pursue these avenues for relief – particularly if problems are occurring while a soldier is on a long-term deployment. Moreover, if a soldier talks to a fellow-soldier about his or her personal problems, he or she risks their privacy and could jeopardise future opportunities for career advancement if their problems become widely known. If the friend is promoted and becomes a superior officer to the soldier with the problem, that private information could be held against the subordinate. In turn, this could affect career advancement opportunities for the subordinate soldier.

Several Ombudsman’s Reports in recent years have demonstrated the military’s attitude toward personnel with mental health issues face. For example the Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence states;


6 Ibid., 2
The tendency among soldiers to stigmatize and humiliate those considered weak is highlighted in a March 2003 report of the Office of the Military Ombudsman into a complaint that one of several parade floats entered into the pre-Grey Cup celebration of the 2 PPCLI in November 2002 mocked soldiers under treatment for operational stress injuries. The investigation concluded that the float prepared by one Company portrayed a mythical “Crazy Train”, and that this “Crazy Train” was a local derogatory reference to members of the Regiment suffering from operational stress injuries. More seriously, the investigation found that the float was part of the ongoing stigmatization of soldiers being treated for operational stress injuries (those that take the train) as being malingerers and fakers trying to escape their duties.⁷

Another report quotes a soldier diagnosed with PTSD:

PTSD is a joke to a lot of people. The guy who got the PTSD card [during injury simulation training]... took off his shirt, started dancing, la-la-la-la-la, like playing the crazy clown sort of thing. I don't remember ever doing that. I just remember crying and thinking, "This is getting out of hand," and quietly kept it to myself.

This highly structured and duty-bound culture places military personnel in a dangerous double bind where they are both stressed and somewhat limited in terms of their outlets for stress relief. The stress experienced by a soldier can be incredibly high because of the types of work she or he does and there is both stigma and risk involved with stating and dealing with personal mental, spiritual and emotional problems.⁸ For example, Statistics Canada states, “…there is an incredible amount of suffering being experienced each year by members of the CF” due to mental depression.⁹ Dr. Allan D. English, in his article Leadership and Operational Stress in the Canadian Forces says that Canadian veterans who served in Croatia, the Gulf War, Somalia, Bosnia and Rwanda, “suffer from certain stress-related illnesses at rates at least three times higher

⁷ The Standing Senate Committee on National Security and Defence…, 21.
⁸ Ibid., 2
⁹ Ibid., 3
than those found in the Canadian population.”\textsuperscript{10} This situation presents a serious challenge for the military institution and for military personnel as mental health problems often increase when they are ignored and left untreated.\textsuperscript{11} This is one area where the role of the chaplain could become crucial to the mental and emotional well-being of military personnel in the future.

**Chaplains and Trust**

A chaplain offers soldiers virtually the only confidential and non-stigmatised opportunity for emotional and spiritual help in the military context. Because a chaplain is involved in the screening of personnel before deployment, she or he has knowledge of a soldier’s family and community.\textsuperscript{12} This privileged insight means that a chaplain’s association with unit members can be “very profound [and] spiritually intense…. [creating a] special trust because he or she has privileged access to all members…”\textsuperscript{13} Of course there are social workers and medical personnel to treat individuals if soldiers are willing to go to them, but Dr. English argues that one problem with the current health care options with respect to veterans, is that:

...health care practitioners have been unable to gain the trust of the veterans who report symptoms of stress-related illness… Evidence has shown that unless health care practitioners involved in treating veterans have credibility based on operational experience, usually in-theatre, veterans are reluctant to see them.\textsuperscript{14}

\textsuperscript{11} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{14} English, *Leadership and Operational Stress in the Canadian Forces* …, 34.
Retired Padre Richard Ruggle, a former member of the staff of the Canadian Forces Chaplain School and Centre, reiterates this position with reference to active soldiers while describing events following a critical incident that occurred during a tour of duty in the former Yugoslavia:

… the military would bring in social workers to deal with the personnel [but] …the guys just didn’t trust them and they wouldn’t talk to them. But … they knew the padre and they trusted the padre. And, the padre knew what they were going through because he was going through it too.  

Padre Ruggle adds that, “The most important thing is that the padres are on the ground when a critical incident happens. They’re an insider; they have seen what has happened.”

In addition to a lack of trust in other service providers, there is stigma attached to needing their help. Presumably, this stigma comes from the idea that people who need psychological care are weak and weakness represents the antithesis to soldiering. It is in this context that the chaplain becomes doubly important. There is no stigma attached to talking to the padre. He is simply a neutral brother or sister in arms – a soldier by appearance and in behaviour, but separate from the competitive and isolationist aspects of the military culture. There is no need “to go to” the padre – he or she is already there with the personnel during physical training, on operations, or having a couple of pints in the mess hall – just “being available and accessible to people.”

The chaplain is an “important member of the command team” because he or she can make recommendations to a soldier’s commanding officer without having to

---

16 Ibid.
17 Padre Chris Gillespie, personal interview 30/09/2004 describing the ministry of presence.
disclose private information about the individual. In cases where there are problems at home or a soldier needs to be repatriated due to a tragedy, “chaplains are often directed to determine the severity of the situation and recommend a course of action” to the Commanding Officer. Chaplains are expected to respond to “spiritual and mental health needs as required… [and know] how to recognize specific psychosocial and spiritual difficulties and make recommendations for referral.” A chaplain may request special leave, additional telephone time or outside counselling for a soldier experiencing emotional and psychological stress. The chaplain, in essence, becomes much more than a preacher or spiritual guide; instead, he or she takes on the role of protector, counsellor and compassionate director, particularly when soldiers are away from home on military duties.

The Ministry of Presence and Relationships

Padre Gary Marche, a Roman Catholic priest who has been deployed many times argues, “…for the soldiers the presence of the chaplains makes a whole lot of difference. … It is all about relationship. The chaplains have a very unique relationship with the troops, not like any other officer, not like any other profession.” This unique role is often referred to as the chaplain’s “ministry of presence.” This ministry is particularly important on deployments where soldiers are disoriented by language and culture and disconnected from their families and the familiar elements of home. The

21 Padre Chris Gillespie personal interview 30/09/2004 describing the responsibilities of chaplains in theatre.
ministry of presence is, "being available to, and known by, the soldier, being available for a comforting chat, developing a relationship with the members of the unit, and participation in unit life...[This ministry] makes the chaplaincy an outward and visible sign of the church who cares and consoles."  

In reference to this ministry, Padre Ruggle said,

In theory [padres are] there to look after the troops' spiritual needs but the troops don’t really express a lot of spiritual needs. [But,] the parson is the person who you talk to. It’s not just that you’re there with them – you are experiencing the [same stresses] that they’re experiencing.  

The ministry of presence offers sanity and consolation in a harsh and difficult environment. Sometimes this presence becomes important on home territory, especially where new recruits are concerned. A former cadet at RMC in Kingston told me,

In six weeks of hell at training camp, the one thing they did right for us was sending us to church because [these were] the only sane, compassionate episodes during that period... [that] validated your feelings of missing your family and being lonely. They would give us some time to write letters home. I mean, we’re talking about 19-year old kids here. Human rights weren't a consideration in this place. There was sexual harassment, alcohol problems, separation from friends and family... but you knew these guys, the padres were on your side...[we knew this] because they told us they were... and they were.

The ministry of presence is perhaps the most important aspect of the military chaplains’ current services in the Canadian Forces. This role is likely to become increasingly important when we consider that our troops now participate in more and more non-combat tours of duty where stress and trauma comes not from war but from dealing with

---

genocide, natural disasters, disease and human rights abuses. Trauma experienced in this context has the power
to throw into question or obliterate any organisation of self, God and humanity. The implications of traumatic events assault anything considered sacred or foundational… The meaning of life is questioned. Old answers no longer suffice. Concerns about identity, the value of suffering, the importance of justice and the appropriateness of forgiveness are figural. Recognizing the amount of evil and cruelty in the world, along with the impact these realities have for images of God and the value of human relationship, demand careful consideration and continual reflection.\(^\text{27}\)

It is very likely that peacekeepers around the world will continue to face this type of trauma in what Roméo Dallaire calls the new “world disorder, [where] the destruction of human life in ‘peacetime’ [is] at an all-time high.”\(^\text{28}\)

Dr. English states that “the current missions of the CF, variously termed operations other than war, such as peacekeeping or peacemaking, may actually be more stressful than combat in war.”\(^\text{29}\) With greater emphasis on peacekeeping, peace building, disaster relief and humanitarian aid, the duties and experiences of Canadian soldiers is changing radically and the stresses associated with peacekeeping deployments continues to exact a toll on personnel in the Canadian Forces. Additionally, the secularisation of Canadian society – “no religion”\(^\text{30}\) places second on the Canada 2001 Census after Christianity – indicates that the relationship personnel

\(^{28}\) Roméo Dallaire, Shake Hands with the Devil: The Failure of Humanity in Rwanda (Toronto: Random House Canada, 2003), 50.
\(^{29}\) English, Leadership and Operational Stress in the Canadian Forces ..., 35.
\(^{30}\) It is unclear exactly what “no religion” means to those who select this option on the survey. While “no religion” may include agnostics, nihilists and atheists, it is also possible that some people in this category follow some aspects of a traditional religion without considering themselves to be followers of that religion.
have to religion is also changing. These new conditions have meant adjustments for military chaplains serving in the field alongside soldiers.

Beyond direct intercession on the behalf of soldiers and advice to commanding officers and the “ministry of presence”, Chaplains also give soldiers hope in concrete situations. The Military Chaplaincy recognises that work which rebuilds disrupted communities and re-establishes peace helps the morale of the troops because “there is very much a sense that when one is physically doing something, that one is making a difference.”

In support of this, chaplains spend seventy-five percent of their time on issues related to supporting personnel while the remaining 25 percent is dedicated to relief initiatives and community work. Often during a mission, chaplains provide counsel “to soldiers and civilians facing extreme challenges,” including several instances during the Balkans Crisis of making efforts toward reconciling “hostile factions and building new bonds of community and peace” through community dialogue and collective rebuilding projects. Chaplains participate in humanitarian aid projects such as fund raising drives, distribution of food and clothing to civilians and building or refurbishing schools and orphanages.

---

31 Statistics Canada. “Overview: Canada still predominantly Roman Catholic and Protestant,”… section Increase in those reporting “No religion.”
Peacekeepers often want to make a difference to the suffering of civilians while on deployment. In fact, on past peacekeeping missions, their "neutral status" which disallowed Peacekeeping and Observer Forces from protecting and helping civilians was a primary cause of PTSD in some cases. For example, Corporal Christian McEachern, a decorated soldier who served on several peacekeeping missions to the Balkans and Africa, was given a dishonourable discharge due to behaviour resulting from undiagnosed PTSD. McEachern describes one incident that occurred while serving as a member of an Observer Force in Uganda:

…there were a number of incidents that happened where we weren’t allowed to do anything about it ‘cause we weren’t in Uganda to do anything… I think the one that bothered me the most was the night the woman got raped right beside our compound, we could see the whole thing and hear her screaming. I called in about three times and asked if I could interfere, fire a shot or do something and I wasn’t allowed to do anything because security for the division compound could not be compromised, so… we just had to stand there and watch. …that was probably the worst…not being able to do anything…you trained hard to go over there and be able to make a differences and then they tie your hands like that.44

When a soldier feels that they are helping the suffering, there is a strong sense that they are working against the problem rather than becoming a part of it. This relief and community work can, “improve soldiers’ morale by giving them constructive tasks. … Helping to identify projects can be an important function of chaplains.”45 Albert Fowler,

---

43 In 2000, the United Nations released the Report of the Panel on United Nations Peace Operations which argued that neutral UN peacekeeping involvement in the face of violations of peace treaties during the 1990s, “in the best case result[ed] in ineffectiveness and in the worst…amount[ed] to complicity with evil.” Because of this report, UN peacekeepers now have greater liberty to intervene on behalf of civilians when violations of a peace treaty occur, “… United Nations peacekeepers — troops or police — who witness violence against civilians should be presumed to be authorized to stop it, within their means, in support of basic United Nations principles.” The full report can be found on-line at http://www.un.org/peace/reports/peace_operations/


in his book *Peacetime Padres*, reiterates this sentiment in his description of a Canadian unit serving in Rwanda:

> The soldiers discovered an orphanage which housed about five hundred displaced children of all ages. Most were sick, with diseases ranging from scabies to cholera. The soldiers, especially those who had children at home, were deeply moved and spent a lot of their off-duty time trying to help the orphans. Eventually, the regiment was supporting 2300 children in six orphanages…

Chaplains play an essential role in such experiences.

**Chaplains and PTSD**

Even as the “no-religions” in Canada increase, military chaplains can offer an invaluable service to personnel in the Canadian Forces as soldiers continue to turn to them for guidance, direction and emotional support during tours of duty and in regular operations – especially when it comes to dealing with Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD). In the preface to his book *Shake Hands with the Devil*, Roméo Dallaire writes this of his experiences in Rwanda that left him emotionally crushed and suffering from PTSD: “…in Rwanda I shook hands with the devil. I have seen him, I have smelled him and I have touched him. I know the devil exists, and therefore I know there is a God.”

Dallaire was the top general in the Canadian Forces before his retirement due to PTSD. If this man can suffer so deeply from his experiences in theatre, so will many more soldiers. Dr. Allan English claims that, “the most effective way to decrease preventable stress-related casualties [is] through a comprehensive and integrated system designed to reduce the effects of the inevitable stress of operations on military personnel.” He argues, “The military commanders must bear the ultimate responsibility for the system.

---

46 Fowler, *Peacetime Padres*... 259.
47 Dallaire,..., preface xviii.
When they have delegated this responsibility to others, such as those in the health care professions, the results have inevitably been unnecessary operational stress casualties." As members of the command team, the chaplain may be the best person to fill this role. Recent studies have shown that addressing a person’s spiritual concerns is often central to the process of healing from PTSD. In a study of Canadian veterans suffering from PTSD, one of the central issues brought up by patient was the role of God in their experiences: “Forces members, like much of the general population, when subjected to extreme stress or crisis often turn to a ‘Higher Power’ looking for answers.” Chaplains, who are members of the command team, if trained properly, can offer “sound psychological support [integrated with appropriate spiritual counsel]… that deals with values of forgiveness, reconciliation, hope, love, compassion and generosity” as a means to the healing of the whole person effected by PTSD.

With correct training, chaplains are in a position to become instrumental in the treatment of operational stress for peacekeepers in the future. The “present-day treatment for operational stress near the front line, emphasiz[es] the principles of immediacy, proximity and expectancy.” This means simply that the soldiers experiencing traumatic stress need to be identified on site (immediacy), treated properly at their location rather than by being shipped out for treatment (proximity) and then returned to his or her duties (expectancy). Military chaplains are trained to identify symptoms of stress and are already important to the aspect of “immediacy” in the

48 English, Leadership and Operational Stress in the Canadian Forces ..., 35-36.
51 Ibid., 35.
treatment of PTSD. Because of their privileged and unique relationship with the soldiers, if they were also trained to give psychological as well as spiritual counsel to personnel, chaplains could become the first line of care in the treatment of PTSD and elemental in the aspect of “proximity.” If these first two areas of treatment are readily available through the relationship and training of the chaplain, the principle of expectancy can occur more rapidly and with greater success for the soldier and the mission.

**Chaplain Self-Care**

This new role for chaplains may pose a risk for the chaplains themselves. A single chaplain may serve over 500 soldiers on a tour of duty. This can cause problems for the chaplain in that his or her own stress can become particularly high – especially on traumatic deployments such as those that occurred in the former Yugoslavia and Rwanda, when “chaplains are often approached to make meaning out of chaos for soldiers who are confronting ‘Man’s inhumanity to Man.’” For example, while the troop of peacekeepers en route to Rwanda had taken special combat training and unit padre David Melanson had taken a course at the Chaplain School specially designed to prepare him for the duties and stresses of a peacekeeping tour, “nothing prepared the padre or his soldiers for the experiences they were about to have.” Padre Melanson describes the unit’s experiences this way:

> Our jobs took us into areas of the country that the troops called… ‘killing fields.’ The majority of these places…were local community parishes and churches.

---

52 See Table 1.
Around the church grounds and in the sanctuaries we found the remains of thousands of human beings; children, women and men slaughtered without mercy. The scenes, the smell and the horror of it was beyond any words that could be uttered. Silence was the only language understood at these sights. In the darkness of night these ‘killing fields’ were often revisited in our dreams.”

In a case like this, the padre is expected to help the soldiers deal with the horrors they are seeing. Unfortunately for the chaplains, they themselves have no chaplain to turn to and, in this particular case, Padre Melanson “found himself listening to an endless flow of stories and emotional outpourings.”

The new chaplain branch says, “its inauguration has witnessed a great outpouring of creativity and tremendous progress in the areas of training, self care, and professional development” as the modern chaplaincy gears up to meet future challenges of the Canadian Forces. “Self care” will be an important skill for chaplains serving Canada’s future peacekeeping troops.

**Religion in the Lives of Soldiers**

Future research that examines the role religion plays for military personnel is essential for the continued success of the Canadian Forces Chaplaincy. Few scholars have examined the question of the role that religion plays for soldiers in the increasingly post-Christian Canadian context. Without this more basic information, we cannot know the most effective means to train chaplains for a broader role in identifying and treating stress. We need to know what role religion plays in the lives of soldiers if we are to begin to understand how some might use spirituality as a bridge to mental health.

---

56 Ibid.
57 Ibid., 259
59 While Duff Crerar’s *Padres in No Man’s Land: Canadian Chaplains in the Great War* (Quebec City: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 1995) reviews the experiences of chaplains in WWI and Al Fowler’s *Peacetime Padres* (St. Catharine’s Ontario: Vanwell Publishing Limited, 1996) describes the experiences of CF padres up until the late 1990s, there is no research to date that examines the role that religion plays in the lives of Canadian soldiers.
and healing. Although the Canadian Forces Chaplaincy is already in a good position to apply their Ministry of Presence to work against the trauma of operational stresses, they will have a far greater likelihood of success if they know the core spiritual needs and values of the men and women they serve. Additionally, as the question of pluralism in the military becomes more significant, chaplains will have to continually reassess their methods in light of the increasing religious and spiritual diversity in the Canadian Forces.

For Canadian Forces women and men the “chaplain is always there, walking alongside people in their days of vulnerability. Homesick recruits, lonely deployed sailors or soldiers, and the wounded PTSD retiree can all receive a ministry of compassion and reconciliation.”61 By providing chaplains with current information on the role religion plays for soldiers, giving them additional training that would allow them to be the first line of treatment for traumatic stress and teaching them better methods of self care, the chaplains’ Ministry of Presence can become an even more important element of care and consolation for men and women of the Canadian Forces.

---

Bibliography


